

The Place of Illegal Immigration in Turkish Internet News: Visibility and Invisibility

Mukadder Çakır

*Marmara University, Faculty of Communication, İstanbul, Turkey,
mukadder.cakir@marmara.edu.tr*

Abstract: This research study explores the visual and textual aspects of internet news on illegal immigration and discusses what is and isn't covered visually and textually, and why. The methods used were qualitative document analysis and a discourse approach. In considering the problem's cultural, sociological, economic, historical and political aspects, the study aims to take a multi-perspective, interdisciplinary and critical approach. Fifty Turkish news stories were examined on 26 different websites in the course of 2011. Illegal immigration is a problem that has grown with globalization; and the inadequacy of immigration policies in developed countries attracting immigrants is compounding the problem, along with diverse political, economic and historical problems in underdeveloped nations. As long as the problems remain unresolved, the death and injury of thousands of immigrants every year will continue.

The conventions of traditional mainstream media carry through into internet journalism: similar characteristics are evident in visual and written material, tragedy is commodified and reduced to the banal. While the images and text of news stories fail to mention the crux and source of the problem and obscure vital aspects, invisibilities include the contradictory positioning of immigration policy in developed countries, these countries' need for skilled man power and efforts to solve the problem through judicial and surveillance mechanisms alone. However, news content and discourse are not independent of the organization and ownership aspects of the media and news websites; they are a product, a part of them.

Keywords: *Internet Journalism, Turkish Internet News, Illegal Immigration, The Visible and Invisible, Invisibilities*

Introduction

The study entailed sourcing 50 news stories on 'illegal immigration' from Turkish websites in the course of 2011; these stories were examined in terms of visual culture using qualitative content analysis and a critical discourse perspective. Both the visual and textual aspects of the news stories were addressed as they show similar characteristics. The study revealed that, in terms of content and discourse, the news stories echoed the news rhetoric dominant in traditional media and matched the characteristics of global mass culture.

Accordingly, the images and text tended to be sensationalist, dramatic and brief narratives which lacked depth, failed to mention the crux of the problem, obscured the important points and commodified the tragic dimension. The invisibilities included problems, conflicts, processes and phenomena, the more vital, local and global elements which embody the source of the problem, which reporters avoid articulating, which go beyond the

nature of the judicial, and which trace the historical, sociological, cultural and economic dimensions. One significant reason why such critical facts are not given mention is that the topic of 'illegal immigration' does not constitute entertainment; it has no pleasure appeal. As for the reason why topics of this kind are not covered in the media and internet journalism, or are covered only in very specific ways, this goes back to the structuring of the media and of the culture industry, and to the system of reproduction.

1. Regarding the Method of Research

The qualitative research document analysis technique was chosen to analyze the social phenomenon (Yıldırım-Şimşek, 2011: 35-37) in this study given that it facilitates interdisciplinary and multi-faceted research, is based on a flexible and holistic approach, allows for content analysis, embraces relativity and enables the researcher to incorporate views and interpretations in the analysis. Where necessary, the critical discourse approach was also utilized.

Qualitative research, as distinct from the quantitative research method, emphasizes the need to adopt open-minded, realistic and exploratory methods which prioritize understanding. (M.Q. Patton, citation Yıldırım-Şimşek, 2011: 37-38)

In using observation, dialogue and document analysis methods, qualitative research (citation Yıldırım-Şimşek, 2011: 43-44) also incorporates the perspective of individuals into the process, and acknowledges the responsibility that subjectivity requires. Social phenomena and processes can thus be considered from a multiple perspective. Data are not reduced to numbers and content analysis can be carried out on numbers. Content and discourse analysis were used particularly in answering why and how questions.

The subject of the study, 'The Place of Illegal Immigration in Turkish Internet News: Visibility and Invisibility', is an interdisciplinary one which brings together different fields such as internet journalism, Turkish websites, illegal immigration and visual culture. For this reason, it required awareness of the economic, political, historical and social aspects.

The Google search engine was used to access data by entering words and word strings such as 'immigration', 'illegal immigration', 'internet journalism', 'immigration news' and 'EU immigration policy'. Key data comprised the photographs and texts of 50 news stories published on 26 different Turkish news websites in 2011. The random sampling method was used to select samples, and maximum variety targeted. Van Dijk's critical discourse was used for perspective. Miles and Huberman's descriptive and interpretative qualitative research (1994: 57) is close to this approach. The subject was examined in three main sections; news stories examined for codification were numbered and referenced to the samples with these numbers.

The analysis of content drew on critical and cultural studies, and perspectives on global media and global mass culture. Photographs, news texts, headlines and news spots were taken as the unit of analysis. As qualitative research does not have to be statistically based, statistical data were utilized only to the extent that they were available. The study aimed to employ a perspective which incorporated different and multiple points of view into the process, evaluated the parts within the whole, and took into account the cyclical aspects of the problem as well as the interwovenness of local media and the global communications environment.

Van Dijk's critical discourse approach mainly emphasizes the sociological dimension (2007: 1) because, as he sees it, discourse is a complex communication process rather than an independent structure. Theoretical realities are also important since they define themselves within inter-disciplinarity as a new 'anti-disciplinary' paradigm. Concepts that are generated may be individual, hypothetical or collective. They may also reveal the local or global aspects of time and place factors. These studies (2009: 17, 62-63, 83) are concerned with reproducing social dominance by means of discourse. In other words, they may also focus on cognitive, local and global actors. This is not only a method; it is also a stance and a form of positioning. Imagery, syntax, intonation, topic, coherence, presuppositions/assumptions, metaphors (figures of speech) and reasoning are discourse structures (13). And discourses are ideologically based; they are an essential part of everyday expression. Power is reproduced within discourse and by discourse.

2. Internet Journalism

As an integrated mass communications vehicle which combines all forms of audio, written and visual data, the internet has fast become the most direct, practical and easiest source for accessing news and knowledge; as a result it has acquired indispensable status in the context of journalism. Along with the internet, knowledge and information in other mass communication vehicles has also become easier to produce, disseminate and structure.

As Ümit Atabek stated (2003: 59-60), the internet has created a large halo of light over us since the day it took off; it has dazzled us. But this halo should not deceive us; we should take a more realistic and critical approach to the internet. After all, other mass communication vehicles produced the same impact when they were developing, yet many hopes were later disappointed. On this basis, we should not be lightheaded in the way we view the internet. Internet journalism has brought with it a plethora of moral or amoral problems related to reporting. John Pavlik (2010) breaks these down into four areas: the way journalists work, the content of news, the structure or organization of newsrooms, and the relationships between them, journalists and their many publics. But the problem is far wider in scope. First and foremost (Evers, 2012), there are serious problems inherent in the interwovenness of news and commercial information, in the increase of sponsored content and the presence of advertisements sometimes even in the middle of the news story. High-quality news and comment are relatively scarce on the internet (Bardoel; 2002) because factors such as speed, brevity and the race against time make it impossible to give full attention to the news story. The line between editorial and commercial content is very thin. News is crudely thrown together and published without being worked on properly; the is thus unpolished. The preoccupation with being first to break the news, ahead of beating other mass communication vehicles, effectively rules out investigative journalism.

The internet may be breaking the monopoly on news reporting, eliminating censorship and exposing a vast number of secrets, but it is also producing new problems of its own: copied news and the inability to transcend 'cut-and-paste' reporting are two examples. Although Turkish news websites appear to be a development, they also resemble a 'website recycle bin' (Atagün, 2012). Scores of journalists in Turkey have been laid off in recent years on the pretext of economic decline; many have since set up their own websites, which has in turn produced some serious critical writing. However, the reporting tradition has a history of 400 years and new problems are not free of the past. The internet is also influencing the traditional media (Atabek, 2003: 74). Conceptions of journalism on Turkish news websites

appear partial. For example, news of specific brands is featured on the first pages; a vast amount of space is allocated to advertising; indeed, on some websites, advertisements block part of the page, preventing access to links. Pages change constantly, serious errors are made in the use of Turkish and these errors even appear in headlines (Balkan, 2012).

Technologically, internet reporting (Bardoel, 2002: 508) provides the opportunity for in-depth study of far more subjects than other mass communication vehicles, for it references different links, words and expressions and enables browsing. Its scope in terms of interaction is similar. However, "if the internet is going to become an important platform for the distribution of content and for the exchange of information and opinions between citizens, we should create adequate conditions for an independent journalism." To trust purely in the internet's technological potential may lead to a delusion. The opportunities of the internet can only be truly exploited through single-mindedness, in other words by being a 'political person' (Atabek, 2003: 77, 80). No technology produces the right results if it is wrongly used. Frustration and disappointment become inevitable. In considering internet related problems, it appears necessary to consider the content dimension over and above the technological equivalent.

3. The Growing Importance of Images in the Media

As Virilio states (2003: 18), a 'generalized visualization' is the most defining characteristic of virtualization today. An image has greater impact than a discourse. Global mass culture (Hall, 1998: 48) is dominated by the image because images easily transcend linguistic boundaries and speak all languages simultaneously. Visual and graphic arts and popular life are reconstructing entertainment and leisure. Television, cinema, mass advertising and visualization mechanisms retain their dominance in every field.

Kellner also draws attention to global mass culture (2010: 9). The internet is an important part of the process, but boom and bust coexist. A creative destruction process has the function of first stimulating, then sustaining global capitalism. As it becomes ever more pervasive, global capitalism is advancing in tandem with the media, the internet and the information and entertainment industries. Technology and capital coincide during this process. And according to Morley and Robins (2011: 57-58), there has been an increase in business mergers, public service broadcasting has begun to collapse and, while national broadcasting systems have been deregulated, mega corporations have tended to build up 'a global space consisting of image flows'. Cultural distribution rather than production is the key point of the process. And this is achieved through satellites and media systems.

Today, images and visuality operate in the form of a spectacle. Debord's theory of the Society of the Spectacle (1996: 13-14, 20-21) has become reality, because in modern society life has evolved into a spectacle. Everything experienced first-hand has given way to spectacle; images plucked from every domain of life have been merged into a common flow. Whether in the form of information, propaganda, advertising or entertainment, spectacle operates as the current model of everyday life.

Spectacle encompasses all areas of the global market from culture, entertainment and politics to sport, business, education, the arts and health; through an ever expanding public relations industry and a never-ending world of image wars, spectacle keeps images alive (Kellner, 2010: 25-26). For a long time, images of individuality and bodies have been taken from the hands of the people they belong to, transformed and manipulated without their

consent. There is a drive to create optical clans and to have them play in new games (Virilio, 2003: 31-32). Baumann, too, (citation Köse, 2010: 203) points to a post-modern surveillance strategy and postulates that those who were once controlled have turned into the players who monitor/keep tabs. This is referred to as the 'media panopticon'. The process in question establishes a direct correlation between the media and concepts such as force, power and control.

In a media spilling over with images, the politics of global communication centre around a 'war of images' and the struggle between 'image superpowers'. Yet while some coverage is explicit, most is obscure. True reality lies in the untold (Burton, 1995: 17-18).

4. Illegal Immigration News on Turkish News Websites: The Visible and Invisible

4.1. The Content of Illegal Immigration News on Turkish News Websites

The news that immigrants had burned to death in an Istanbul shanty house on 9 October 2011 was featured only fleetingly in the media before quickly falling into obscurity. The subject of this research paper was chosen with the aim of discussing why, when human dramas of this kind are obviously happening, they and similar stories are not given the importance they merit. How are all the various workings of illegal immigration represented in internet news? What is included in the visual and written coverage? And what kind of invisibilities are present in this coverage?

Choice of topic is in itself an ideological choice; it also falls within the field of discourse. Topics incompatible with the spectacle mentality of popular culture, which are disagreeable or unlikely to draw interest are chosen less often (Van Dijk, 2003: 59). And problems associated with illegal immigration fall into this category. They are tedious, depressing and distressing. Twenty-one of the 50 news stories relating to illegal immigration, or 42 percent, involved the topics of death, disappearance and being caught. Immigrants were mainly referred to in terms of numbers and ethnic origin. Questioning the whys and wherefores was avoided in favour of brief and simplistic narratives. In stories of immigrants being caught, there was frequent use of terms such as 'captured', 'dispatched to', 'caught', 'sent to prison', 'handed over', 'seized', 'given health checks' and 'police statements taken'. As these incidents are always referred to in the same way, the discourse used was along the lines of 'caught again', 'captured again', 'arrested again' or 'deported again'; the cases were treated as routine news, as if standard, irresolvable judicial-police cases. (Example: news story numbers 1, 2, 4, 5, 6, 7, 10, 15, 16, 17, 19, 20, 27, 29, 30, 32, 33, 36, 41, 42, 50.) In this type of news story, immigrants were generally referred to as being 'caught in the act'; thus the discourse and content of the news story readily created the impression of potential criminality. In news stories of immigrants caught, a point was made of stating that the vehicle driver or boat captain had been arrested; they were declared as the persons responsible who had been successfully seized by the police. Photograph images showed drowned bodies washed up onshore, or the bodies of those dead from other causes lined up on the ground; alternatively, they depicted people caught red-handed in boats, lorries, minibuses etc, averting their eyes or covering their faces. Deportation stories, on the other hand, tended to create the impression of the problem having been resolved.

However, in the case of most immigrants, repatriation is tantamount to death or a return to intolerable conditions. In virtually none of the stories was this point given mention.

Sixteen of the 50 news stories, or 32 per cent, had a bearing on the EU and were all marked by a particular kind of content and discourse. While the contradictory stance of EU countries on the problem received almost no mention, topics dealt with regularly included EU condemnations of Turkey as a transit country, EU support for border controls, the decline of immigration in the region thanks to these measures, the size of budgets allocated to such measures, the constant development of new plans and projects, the number of immigrants crossing the Turkish-Greek border every day, the digging of long trenches, the work of Frontex (the EU agency for external border security) forces and the like. (Example: news story numbers 3, 9, 11, 12, 21, 23, 28, 31, 32, 38, 39, 40, 43, 44, 45, 46.)

Measures taken to combat illegal immigration were dealt with in 11 of the 50 news stories, or 22 per cent. In terms of content and discourse, coverage included spending on these measures, the employment potential in developed countries, meetings between authorities, the outcome of the meetings, the role of terrorist organizations and the money they make from it. (Example: news story numbers 9, 11, 12, 22, 23, 31, 34, 44, 47, 48, 49.)

News stories giving precedence to statistical data were numerous: 16 of the 50 stories, or 16 per cent, fell into this category. Here, content and discourse focused mainly on topics such as numbers of dead, numbers of immigrants caught, figures for the last 12 months, five and 10 years, the statistical results of the figures for Turkey and the rest of the world, what percentage were from which countries and of which race, how many were deported and how many illegal immigrants found in which countries. (Example: news story numbers 1, 3, 5, 6, 7, 10, 15, 16, 17, 19, 20, 29, 30, 33, 36, 41.) Striking figures were carried in headlines; in some stories, numbers eclipsed the topic; in others they were enlightening.

Stories bearing the characteristics of news features tended to be a little more enlightening, more distinct and more holistic in content and discourse. However, news features were notably few in number and did not reflect the broader picture. Of the 50 stories, only five, or 10 per cent, matched this description. (Example: news story numbers 24, 35, 38, 45, 46.)

A phenomenon that applied to the stories as a whole was news concerning the meetings, statements and talks of authorities in charge, national or international negotiations, briefings, symposiums, official projects and responses. It was notable that these stories failed to break the bounds of routine, formal reporting.

4. 2. The Visible and Invisible in Images and Text

Once a topic has been selected for a news story, information is provided about the event which is either detailed or spare; this is a choice. The choice is reflected in both the images and the writing. The fact that there are correspondences between the text and visuals is no coincidence: the two are complementary. After all, meaning is not created with words alone; images also play a significant role. Some images may, in fact, be more powerful than words. Giving emphasis to different and specific visuals is an easy way of obscuring the facts, not stating them or making them unknowable. The shallow and erroneous opinions that take shape at this point may not even arouse suspicion.

The question of whether or not to disclose the information is not ideologically impartial. Disclosing bad things about people who aren't one of us is a common tendency (Van Dijk,

2003: 60). Revealing a particular thing is a signalling tendency; not revealing something else is an obscuring tendency and at the same time a breaking point.

Images of illegal immigrants taken at national borders and featured in the media foster feelings of fear and panic towards these people; they almost objectify them. The X-rays picking out illegal immigrants in a lorry turn these people into fugitive phantoms, whipping up hatred and the impulse to ostracize, while at the same time evoking associations with a horror film. New technologies seek through advanced techniques to make visual things which in reality are invisible, things which cannot be seen. This is why Foucault warns that "visibility is a trap". Yet even the most advanced technologies cannot identify the invisibility inherent in the visible. Bentham also realized this (Saybaşıllı, 2007: 28-29). The facts which aren't visualized or written about in visual and written material in the media are greater in number than those that are visualized and written about; they are also harsher and more serious in nature. The practice of not dealing adequately with dramatic facts, of glossing over and failing to consider them in any depth, in other words of obscuring the facts, of making them invisible, applies in particular to the crucial points of the problems. With the news stories examined, it was notable that headlines were chosen from words as graphic, as gut-wrenching and as eye-catching as possible; that spots expanded slightly on these headlines, but were similar in tone; and that the body text failed to live up to the pitch of the headlines and spots. The visual content tended to centre on images of the moment of capture on (boat, train, etc) journeys; of shocked immigrants packed like sardines (into boats, overland vehicles or the room of a building), looking guilty and dazed; of the remnants of sunken boats; of covered immigrant corpses washed up on the shore; of illegal immigrant groups being shown to the press at the foot of a wall or in a room; of authorities holding talks; and of statements being made in meeting rooms and at conferences, etc...

Far more prolific, however, was the invisible, things that appeared neither in images nor text: families scattered and waiting, missing children, the true numbers of immigrants dying or disappearing in transit, the savings paid to organized gangs and human traffickers, lost hopes, ways of applying to illegal immigration, problems encountered with criminal organizations, the conditions awaiting immigrants in the event of repatriation and similar realities. The international dimension of the problem was considered only at a limited level, and specifically the perspective of EU countries, the impartial and contradictory stance of this perspective, adjustment problems among accepted immigrants, the position and life-threatening dangers faced by immigrants in the event of repatriation, the tendency of EU countries to condemn other countries (Turkey, for example) and their failure to take on the necessary responsibility, and efforts to resolve this major problem in the manner of ordinary judicial cases simply by focusing on border controls and surveillance techniques.

EU immigration policy attaches great importance to treaties that encourage and facilitate voluntary return, for it is based around accepting those immigrants with potential for employment in its own territory and sending back the others. However, news stories almost never deal with this problem either visually or in writing. As a result, the whys and wherefores of the problem cannot be exposed. Given that the problems look set to endure, these journeys embarked on with hope will carry on with the death and injury, the long periods of detention, and substantial material and moral losses that they entail.

What was also notable was the absence of investigative journalism practices, such as canvassing the opinions of experts, elaborating on alternatives and giving place to different interpretations in an endeavour to resolve the problem. In particular, the misguidedness and

inadequacy of developed countries' immigration policies, and their role in the growth of the problem are among topics which received no mention.

Results

Illegal immigration was chosen as the subject of this research study on the back of a news story featuring the bodies of seven illegal immigrants; they had burned to death in Istanbul on 9 October 2011 in a small, locked and bolted shanty house described as a 'shock house'. During research, illegal immigration vindicated itself as a problem of many dimensions. The task of studying the problem through news stories on Turkish websites revealed more fundamental problems, such as the workings of the media, the structure of the culture industries, dominant approaches to reporting and the orientation of internet reporting.

The problem is one of people in underdeveloped countries refusing to accept their own dire living conditions and leaving their countries with aspirations for a more humane and democratic life in wealthy, developed countries; of these people falling into the hands of unlawful criminal organizations and losing their savings, their hopes and even their lives on these journeys; and of the further increase in such losses and casualties every year. As the globalization process has intensified since the 1980s, so this has facilitated the circulation and transfer of industrial and financial capital, goods, the managerial elite and all forms of information. By contrast, the circulation and travel to different countries of workers and the poor in the underdeveloped world have become more difficult and increasingly hampered by diverse control and interception mechanisms and monitoring methods (Kırlı, 2012). The principle of free circulation for EU citizens functions as a privilege; but while on the one hand the EU seeks to deter immigration from underdeveloped countries with hard-line police measures, it also avoids enforcing a zero immigration policy. The EU's demographic problem has necessitated the arrival of active immigrants in specific numbers due to the extremely low birth rates currently seen in Europe. In 2010, for example, birth rates stood at 0.24 per cent in Germany, 0.09 per cent in Poland, 0.23 per cent in Austria and 0.52 per cent in France (www.indexmundi.com/facts). If European countries were to introduce zero immigration, they would soon find themselves unable to attend to vital tasks.

In spite of its demographic and economic situation, the EU persists in exercising tough and extremely rigid protection measures together with visa clampdowns. It accuses Turkey, as a transit country, of failing to stem the tide of immigration, which in turn puts a strain on bilateral relations. While unlawful immigration has all the appearances of a social and global problem, the way incidents are portrayed and the discourse used in the media, on the internet, in news images and texts are far from problem solving; rather, they tend to aggravate the problem and make it even more insoluble.

Conclusions

Human rights violations, repressive practices and political instability in underdeveloped countries are among the factors contributing to the growth of immigration. Economic causes include the large scale unemployment that has resulted from neoliberal policies, the collapse of traditional solidarity mechanisms and the decline of the social state mentality (Daniş, 2004: 264). The proliferation of protective measures by developed countries and the gradual fall-off in legal immigration are adding to illegal immigration; people fleeing

from poverty, unemployment and war are being pushed into the hands of crime rings, which in itself is the cause of numerous deaths and injury (<http://www.unhcr.org/pages/>). Human trafficking has become the most profitable field for criminal organizations, but it isn't simply a criminal and judicial problem. In tackling the problem, both the criminal and human dimensions should be addressed. Any analysis of illegal immigration should take into account the cultural, economic, sociological and historical causes, as well as the media dimension. The solution lies not in marginal surveillance systems and visa controls, but in reasonable procedures. As for the extent to which the illegal immigration problem is covered in the media and internet news, this is crucial with respect to content and discourse, for both are instrumental in reproducing the problem.

While Adorno (2007: 71-72) talks about the culture industry repressing and obscuring certain things, sublimating and overstating certain things and repeating them to the point of castration, he also points out that this process stimulates masochistic pleasure, updates all forms of entertainment all over again, refines entertainment and elevates it from the status of boring. The destruction of the tragic, the rejection of the tragic and escape from the poison of tragedy are all possible in this process when the individual is numbed by dominant and pervasive culture (92). Prevailing culture treats the tragic with ironic sadness, as something striking, interesting and different. "Tragedy is reduced to the threat to destroy everyone who fails to cooperate" (88). However, walking away from tragedy means looking on at one's own self-destruction. The promise of happiness, humour, entertainment and the conversion to spectacle are the panacea of the culture industry (73). Reality ceases to be intolerable thanks to the atmosphere of the spectacle.

The common perception of reporting does not entail examining the whys and wherefores of a problem and seeking to propose solutions; it is a perception based upon exploiting the emotions of its audience, as can be seen particularly in news stories of accidents or death involving people from the lower strata of society. The problem is not just a problem of discourse, or of how the visual and written elements of news are produced and disseminated. The real problem is the way in which the culture industries or the media operate, it is their profit oriented and competition based set-up, in other words the economic and political structure of the media. This arises from the drive to make everything visible, to produce images, to place the camera everywhere, and at the same time to learn everything readily and in particular to control. In fact, this trend shows a trait in common with today's power structures. The way in which the media deals with topics, and the forms of discourse it uses are crucial in the context of providing a basis for reproducing problems. The visible and the invisible are a part of this problem.

Turkish Website News Stories Examined

1. "Edirne'de 99 Kaçak Göçmen Yakalandı" ['99 Illegal Immigrants Caught in Edirne'] (10.12.2011) <http://www.haber7.com/haber>
2. "Umuda Yolculuk Antalya'da Sona Erdi" ['Journey to Hope Ends in Antalya'] (06.04.2011) <http://www.kenthaber.com>
3. "Yunanistan'da 470 Bin 'Yasadışı Göçmen' Var" ['Greece Home to 470 Thousand "Illegal Immigrants"'] (14.01.2011) <http://www.haberler.gen.al>
4. "Umuda Yolculuğun Bittiği An" ['Finale of a Journey to Hope'] (16.06.2011) <http://dunya.milliyet.com.tr>
5. "Muğla'da 13'ü Çocuk 81 Kaçak Göçmen" ['81 Illegal Immigrants in Muğla, 13 of Them Children'] (08.10.2011) <http://www.sabah.com.tr/>
6. "Edirne'de 99 Kaçak Göçmen Yakalandı" ['99 Illegal Immigrants Caught in Edirne'] (10.12.2011) <http://www.haberler.gen.al>
7. "Edirne'den Kırıkkale'ye Gönderilen 26 Kaçak Sınır Dışı Edildi" ['26 Stowaways Sent from Edirne to Kırıkkale Are Deported'] (30.07.2011) <http://www.haberler.gen.al>
8. "Canımı Kurtarmak İçin Kaçtım" ["I Escaped to Save My Life"] (31.07.2011) <http://spor.milliyet.com.tr/>
9. "AB Yunanistan'ı Schengen'den Atıyor" ['EU Throws Greece out of Schengen'] (15.09.2011) <http://www.sondakikahaberleri.info.tr>
10. "29 Göçmen Havasızlıktan Boğulmak Üzereyken Bulundu" ['29 Immigrants Found on Brink of Suffocation'] (19.07.2011) <http://www.haberler.gen.al>
11. "Sınıra Hendek Adaya Asker" ['Trenches on the Border, Troops on the Island'] (05.08.2011) <http://dunya.milliyet.com.tr/>
12. "Türkiye-Yunanistan Sınırına Dikenli Tele Avrupa Desteği" ['European Backing for Razor Wire on Turkish-Greek Border'] (06.08.2011) <http://dunya.milliyet.com.tr>
13. "Serbest Dolaşımda Çıkmaz Sokak" ['Impasse on Freedom of Movement'] (05.05.2011) <http://www.turkishnews.com/tr/>
14. "Göçmen Ailelerin Dramı Ses Getirdi" ['Drama of Immigrant Families Causes Stir'] (18.09.2011) <http://dunya.milliyet.com.tr/>
15. "Ölüm Yolunda 70 kişi Daha" ['70 More on Road to Death'] (14.10.2011) <http://www.haberturk.com/yasam>
16. "Keşan'da 24 Kaçak Göçmen Yakalandı" ['24 Illegal Immigrants Caught in Keşan'] (13.08.2011) <http://www.haberler.gen.al>
17. Şardan, Tolga "10 Metrekarede Özgürlüğe Kaçış" ['Flight to Freedom in 10 Square Metres'] (21.11.2011) <http://gundem.milliyet.com.tr>
18. Ünal, Burcu "Kardeşim Batan Gemide Olabilir" ["My Brother Could Be on the Boat which Sank"] (20.12.2011) <http://gundem.milliyet.com.tr>

19. "Moskova'da 500 Vietnamlı Kaçak Göçmen Yakalandı" ['500 Vietnamese Illegal Immigrants Caught in Moscow'] (05.05.2011) <http://www.haberler.gen.al>
20. "Kaçak Göçmen Ölümünde 16 Gözaltı" ['16 Arrested over Illegal Immigrant Death'] (12.07.2011) <http://www.cnnturk.com>
21. "Yasadışı Göç Problemi Avrupa'yı Tedirgin Ediyor" ['Illegal Immigration Problem Troubles Europe'] (15.02.2011) <http://turkish.ruvr.ru>
22. "Eyaletler Yasadışı Göçe Karşı Yeni Yollar Arıyor" ['US States Seek New Ways to Solve Illegal Immigration'] (24.11.2011) <http://www.turkishny.com>
23. "Belçika Yasadışı Göç Eden Kosovalıları Geri Gönderecek" ['Belgium to Send Back Illegal Kosovan Immigrants'] (20.04.2011) <http://kosovaport.com>
24. Alkan, M. N. (28.01.2011) "Duvara Karşı" ['Against the Wall'] http://ekoformdergi.com/yazi_oku.php
25. "Göçmenler, açlık grevine başka bir binada devam edecek" ['Immigrants to Continue Hunger Strike in Another Building'] <http://www.haberler.gen.al>
26. "Kaçak Göçmen Taşıyan Türk Gemileri Sorunu" ['Problem of Turkish Ships Carrying Illegal Immigrants'] (07.09.2011) <http://siyaset.milliyet.com.tr>
27. "İnsan kaçakçıları Datça'da yakalandı" ['Human Traffickers Caught in Datça'] (23.11.2011) <http://www.focushaber.com/insan>
28. "Türkiye 'Uyuşturucu ve Yasadışı Göç'te Kilit Ülke" ['Turkey is Key Country in "Drugs and Illegal Immigration"'] (06.05.2011) <http://www.sonhaber.nl>
29. "Durdurulan Çalıntı Plâkalı Minibüsten 21 Kaçak Mülteci Çıktı" ['21 Illegal Asylum Seekers Surface when Minibus with Stolen Plates Is Stopped'] (17.05.2011) <http://www.haberler.gen.al>
30. "Ada açıklarında 67 kaçak göçmen yakalandı" ['67 Illegal Immigrants Caught off Island'] (15.08.2011) <http://dunya.milliyet.com.tr>
31. "Avrupa, Göçmen Sorununu Çözmeye Kararlı" ['Europe Determined to Solve Immigration Problem'] (22.06.2011) <http://tr.euronews.com>
32. "İtalya'nın Baş Ağrısı Mülteciler" ['Asylum Seekers are Italy's Headache'] (30.03.2011) <http://tr.euronews.com>
33. "Ortaca'da 67 Kaçak Göçmen Yakalandı" ['67 Illegal Immigrants Caught in Ortaca'] (07.10.2011) <http://www.aktifhaber.com>
34. "Türkiye, Giderek Artan Kaçak Göçmen Sorunu ile Mücadele Ediyor" ['Turkey Battles with Ever Growing Illegal Immigrant Problem'] (01.11.2011) <http://turkey.setimes.com/tr>
35. "Göçmen Karşıtı Vali, Dedesinin ABD'de Kaçak Göçmen Olduğunu Kabul Etti" ['Anti-Immigrant Governor Admits Grandfather Was Illegal Immigrant in USA'] (10.09.2011) <http://amerikabulteni.com>
36. "60 Kaçak Göçmen Kaçırıldı" ['60 Illegal Immigrants Kidnapped'] (27.06.2011) <http://dunya.milliyet.com.tr>

37. “Kaçak Göçmen Gemisi Battı: 197 Ölü” [‘Illegal Immigrant Boat Sinks: 197 Dead’] (06.07.2011) <http://www.zaman.com.tr/haber>
38. Çakır, Esmâ, “Türkiye Geçiş Köprüsü” [‘Turkey Is Transit Country’] (08.11.2011) <http://gundem.milliyet.com.tr>
39. “AB’nin Türkiye Kâbusu: Yasadışı Göç” [EU’s Turkish Nightmare: Illegal Immigration’] (02.08.2011) <http://www.taraf.com.tr/haber>
40. “Rasmussen: Ortadoğu’daki Karışıklık Yasadışı Göçü Artırabilir-Brüksel” [‘Rasmussen: Turmoil in Middle East Could Increase Illegal Immigration – Brussels’] (07.02.2011) <http://www.medya73.com>
41. “Akdeniz’de 30 Ceset Bulundu!” [‘30 Bodies Found in Mediterranean!’] (30.07.2011) <http://dunya.milliyet.com.tr>
42. “İnsan Kaçakçıları Datça’da Yakalandı” [‘Human Traffickers Caught in Datça’] (23.11.2011) <http://www.focushaber.com>
43. “Yasadışı Göç Artacak” [‘Illegal Immigration to Rise’] (18.02.2011) <http://www.hurriyet.de/haberler/gundem/831848>
44. “Fronteks Birliklerinin de Koruyamadığı Yunanistan-Türkiye Sınırına Tel Örgü Çekilecek” [‘Razor Wire to Be Erected on Greek-Turkish Border Frontex Forces Failed to Secure’] (03.01.2011) <http://www.haberler.gen.al>
45. Erbaş, Baha (10.03.2011) “Kuzey Afrika – AB İlişkileri” [‘North African-EU Relations’] <http://www.usasabah.com>
46. İdiz, S. (30.09.2011) “AB’ye Yasadışı Göç Türkiye’nin de Sorunu” [‘Illegal Immigration to EU Is Turkey’s Problem Too’] <http://cadde.milliyet.com.tr>
47. “Rumlar Yasadışı Göç konusunda AB’den Yardım İstedi” [‘Greek Cypriots Seek Help from EU on Illegal Immigration’] (22.01.2011) <http://www.abhaber.com>
48. “İtalya AB’den Yardım Bekliyor” [‘Italy Waits for Help from EU’] (15.02.2011) <http://www.dw.de/dw/article/>
49. “Yasadışı Göç AB Merceği” [‘EU Spotlight on Illegal Immigration’] (07.05.2011) <http://www.hudutgazetesi.com/haber>
50. “222 Bin Kaçak Göçmen Yakalandı” [‘222 Thousand Illegal Immigrants Caught’] (14.11.2011) <http://www.haberler.com>

Sources:

- Adorno, T. (2008). *Dialectic of Enlightenment*. Trans.: J. Cumming. London-New York: Verso.
- Adorno, T. (2007). *Kültür Endüstrisi, Kültür Yönetimi* [The Culture Industry, Culture and Administration]. Trans.: N. Ülner, M. Tüzel, E. Gen. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.
- Atagün, K. (26.02.2012). *İnternet Haberciliği* [Internet Journalism]. <http://www.netpano.com/makale>.

- Atabek, Ü. (2003). Yeni İletişim Teknolojileri ve Yerel Medya İçin Olanaklar. Yeni İletişim Teknolojileri ve Medya [New Communication Technologies and Opportunities for Local Media. New Communication Technologies and the Media]. Ed.: S. Alankuş. İstanbul: IPS İletişim Vakfı Yay., 55-84.
- Balkan, A. A. (20.02.2012). İnternet Haberciliği mi Reklâm Sitesi mi: İnternethaber [Internet News: Internet Journalism or Advertising Website?]. <http://ahmetalpbalcan.com/blog/internet>.
- Bardoel, J. (2002) Gazette: The International Journal For Communication Studies. Vol. 64 (5): 501-511.
- Burton, G. (1995). Görünenden Fazlası [More than Meets the Eye]. Trans.: Nefin Dinç. İstanbul: Alan Yayınları.
- Castles, S.-Miller M. J. (2003). The Age of Migration. Palgrave Macmillan, 2003.
- Danış, A. D. (08-09. 2004). Yeni Göç Hareketleri ve Türkiye [New Immigration Movements and Turkey]. Birikim No. 184-185: 216-224.
- Debord, G. (1996). Gösteri Toplumu ve Yorumlar [The Society of the Spectacle and Interpretations]. Trans.: A. Ekmekçi, O. Taşkent. İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları.
- Evers, H. (26.02.2012). İnternet haberciliği: Yeni etik sorunlar mı? [Internet Journalism: New Ethical Questions?] <http://ilef.ankara.edu.tr>.
- Hall, S. (1998). Yerel ve Küresel: Küreselleşme ve Etniklik [The Local and the Global: Globalization and Ethnicity]. Trans.: G. Seçkin, Ü.H.Yolsal. Kültür, Küreselleşme ve Dünya Sistemi [Within Culture Globalization and the World System]. Ed.: A. King. Ankara: Bilim ve Sanat Yay.
- Hospers, J. (1998). A Libertarian Argument Against Open Borders. Journal of Libertarian Studies 13 (2): 153-165.
- Jandl, M. (2004). The Estimation of Illegal Migration in Europe, Migration Studies, Vol. XLI. No 153 (3): 141-155.
- Kellner, Douglas (2010). Medya Gösterisi [The Media Spectacle]. Trans.: Zeynep Paşalı. İstanbul: Açılım Kitap.
- Key Migration Terms (2012). <http://www.iom.int/jahia/Jahia/about>.
- Kırlı, Ö. (2012). Yasadışı Göç [Illegal Immigration]. <http://idc.sdu.edu.tr>.
- Köse, H. (2011). Synoptikon Evresindeki İletişim ya da Küresel Gözetim Toplumunda İktidar Görünmezliğinin Sonu [Communication in the Synopticon Stage or the End of Government Invisibility in the Global Surveillance Society]. Medya Mahrem. Ed.: H. Köse. İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yay., 199-222.
- Miles, M.B., Huberman, A.M. (1994). Qualitative Data Analysis, London: Sage Public.
- Morley, D., Robins, K. (2010). Kimlik Mekânları [Spaces of Identity]. Ed.: Mehmet Küçük. Trans.: E. Zeybekoğlu. İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yay.
- Olson, S. (17.02.2012). Effects of Illegal Immigration on Communities. www.lcms.org.
- Pavlik, J. (2000). The Impact of Technology on Journalism. Journal. Stud. 1 (2): 229-237.

- Population Growth (Annual %) (27.03.2012). <http://www.indexmundi.com/facts>.
- Saybaşı, N. (Sep 2007). "Giriş" Toplum Bilim Derg., Görsel Kültür Özel Sayısı [Introduction, Sociology Magazine, Visual Culture special ed]. No. 22: 17-32.
- Schuck, P. H., (2007) Public Attitudes and Policy Outcomes. Ed.: Carol M. Swain. Debating Immigration. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Van Dijk, T. (2009). Critical Discourse Studies: A Sociocognitive Approach. Ed.: R. Wodak & M. Meyer, Methods of Critical Discourse Analysis. London: Sage. 62-85
- Van Dijk, T. (2007). The Study of Discourse: an Introduction. In Teun Van Dijk (Ed.), Discourse Studies. 5 Vols. Sage Benchmarks in Discourse Studies. London: Sage.
- Van Dijk, T. (2003). Söylem ve İdeoloji [Discourse and Ideology]. In Söylem ve İdeoloji [Discourse and Ideology] içinde (Ed.) B. Çoban, Z. Özarslan. İstanbul: Su Yay., 13-112.
- Virilio, P. (2003). Enformasyon Bombası [The Information Bomb]. Trans.: Kaya Şahin. İstanbul: Metis Yayınları.
- Yıldırım, A.; Şimşek, H. (2011). Sosyal Bilimlerde Nitel Araştırma Yöntemleri [Methods of Qualitative Research in Social Sciences]. Ankara: Seçkin Yayınları.
- 2012 Regional Operations Profile Europe (29.03.2012). <http://www.unhcr.org/pages>